



WALES AUDIT OFFICE
SWYDDFA ARCHWILIO CYMRU

Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru
Auditor General for Wales

Well-being of Future Generations: An Examination of ‘Develop and Launch a New Transport and Clean Air Vision for the City’ – **Cardiff Council**

Audit year: 2018-19

Date issued: July 2019

Document reference: 1376A2019-20



This document has been prepared for the internal use of Cardiff Council as part of work performed/to be performed in accordance with the Well-being of Future Generations Act (Wales) 2015.

No responsibility is taken by the Auditor General, the staff of the Wales Audit Office or in relation to any member, director, officer or other employee in their individual capacity, or to any third party.

In the event of receiving a request for information to which this document may be relevant, attention is drawn to the Code of Practice issued under section 45 of the Freedom of Information Act 2000.

The section 45 Code sets out the practice in the handling of requests that is expected of public authorities, including consultation with relevant third parties. In relation to this document, the Auditor General for Wales, the Wales Audit Office and relevant third parties. Any enquiries regarding disclosure or re-use of this document should be sent to the Wales Audit Office at

info.officer@audit.wales.

We welcome correspondence and telephone calls in Welsh and English. Corresponding in Welsh will not lead to delay. Rydym yn croesawu gohebiaeth a galwadau ffôn yn Gymraeg a Saesneg. Ni fydd gohebu yn Gymraeg yn arwain at oedi.

The team who delivered the work comprised Jeff Brown and Ron Price under the direction of Sara-Jane Byrne.

Contents

The Council has incorporated the sustainable development principle in its approach to developing the vision for Transport and Clean Air in Cardiff.

The Council now needs to embed a consistent understanding and application of the principle and five ways of working in its endeavours to improve outcomes for its citizens.

Summary report

Summary	4
---------	---

Detailed report

Part One: Examination Findings	6
--------------------------------	---

The Council has a good understanding of current and future need. However, the potential impact of the Metro and the Council's other priorities should be factored into any long-term interventions	6
--	---

Prevention activity is at the centre of the Green Paper with targets established to monitor the impact of preventative interventions and solutions	7
--	---

There is clear integration of the sustainable development principle in the Council's policy priorities focussing on critical public health issues and sustainable transport solutions, but there is scope to strengthen its approach to integration, for example with neighbouring councils.	8
--	---

The Council is collaborating with PSB partners to develop long-term solutions for active travel and public health. The Council would benefit from introducing a similar approach to collaboration with other Capital Region Councils	9
--	---

Extensive, independent and well-resourced consultation process undertaken with significant response to the 'Big Ideas'. However, there is scope for clearer involvement of the full diversity of citizens in the design of interventions	10
--	----

Part Two: Cardiff Council's response	11
--------------------------------------	----

Appendices

Appendix 1: Positive Indicators of the Five Ways of Working	15
---	----

Summary report

Summary

Why we undertook the Examination

1 In accordance with the Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015 (the Act) the Auditor General for Wales (the Auditor General) is statutorily required to examine public bodies to assess the extent to which they have acted in accordance with the sustainable development principle when:

- a. setting their wellbeing objectives; and
- b. taking steps to meet them.

The Act defines the sustainable development principle as acting in a manner: '...which seeks to ensure that the needs of the present are met without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own needs'.

2 The Auditor General must provide a report on his examinations to the National Assembly for Wales at least a year before each Assembly election. The first such report must be published by 2020, before the 2021 Assembly election.

3 During 2018-19 the Auditor General is undertaking examinations across the 44 bodies covered by the Act to inform his report to the National Assembly.

4 In May 2018, the Auditor General published his report, **Reflecting on Year One – How have public bodies responded to the Well-being of Future Generations Act (2015)**. He concluded that, public bodies support the principles of the Act and are taking steps to change how they work.

5 In developing our approach to undertaking the examinations during 2018-19 we engaged with a range of stakeholders including through our pilot work during 2017-18. We also worked closely with the Future Generations Commissioner.

6 As the preliminary work in year one included a consideration of how public bodies had set their wellbeing objectives the principal focus of this work is the way in which public bodies are taking steps to meet their wellbeing objectives.

7 The findings in this report are based on fieldwork that we undertook during the period February 2019 to March 2019.

8 This report sets out our findings from our examination of 'Develop and launch a new Transport and Clean Air Vision for the City', a step the Council is taking to meet its wellbeing objectives.

9 It also sets out the Council's initial response to our findings.

What we examined

- 10 We examined the extent to which the Council is acting in accordance with the sustainable development principle in developing and launching a new Transport and Clean Air Vision for the City. The scope of our examination included the publication of a Green Paper on Transport and Clean Air in March 2018 containing 18 'big ideas' for the future of transport in the City. The Green Paper was subject to three months' public consultation.
- 11 In order to act in accordance with the sustainable development principle, public bodies must take account of the following 'ways of working'.

Exhibit 1: the 'five ways of working'

The table below sets out the 'five ways of working' as defined in the Welsh Government's **Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015 The Essentials**¹ document.

The Five Ways of Working
Long term The importance of balancing short-term needs with the need to safeguard the ability to also meet long-term needs.
Prevention How acting to prevent problems occurring or getting worse may help public bodies meet their objectives.
Integration Considering how the public body's wellbeing objectives may impact upon each of the well-being goals, on their other objectives, or on the objectives of other public bodies.
Collaboration Acting in collaboration with any other person (or different parts of the body itself) that could help the body to meet its wellbeing objectives.
Involvement The importance of involving people with an interest in achieving the wellbeing goals, and ensuring that those people reflect the diversity of the area which the body serves.

- 12 Our examination found that: The Council has incorporated the sustainable development principle in its approach to developing the vision for Transport and Clean Air in Cardiff. The Council now needs to embed a consistent understanding and application of the principle and five ways of working in its endeavours to improve outcomes for its citizens.

¹ Welsh Government, **Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015 The Essentials**, 2015

Detailed report

Part One: examination findings

The Council has a good understanding of current and future need. However, the potential impact of the Metro and the Council's other priorities should be factored into any long-term interventions

What we looked for

- 13 We looked for evidence of:
- a thorough understanding of current and long-term needs and the associated challenges and opportunities;
 - planning over an appropriate timescale;
 - resources allocated to ensure long-term benefits; and
 - appropriate monitoring and review.
- 14 Our examination was also informed by the positive indicators for the 'long term' that we have identified and used as part of this examination.²

What we found

- 15 We identified the following strengths:
- good use of modelling data looking at how future interventions will impact on air quality and economic impacts;
 - sustainable travel agenda set in the context of long term aspirations, behaviour change and planning;
 - examples of current successes in its approach to future proofing active and sustainable travel;
 - separate Annual Transport Survey used to develop the Council's understanding of current and future need, risks and trends; and
 - developers held to account to provide more sustainable travel provision.
- 16 We identified the following areas for improvement:
- comparison with other cities and clarity about national and international solutions should be more explicit in developing long-term sustainable solutions;

² See Appendix 1

- to fully articulate the interdependencies between the long-term sustainable transport plans for the City and the successful implementation of the Metro; and
- consider how well long-term budget setting decisions reflect the Council's priorities such as the impact on sustainable travel.

Prevention activity is at the centre of the Green Paper with targets established to monitor the impact of preventative interventions and solutions

What we looked for

- 17 We looked for evidence of:
- a thorough understanding of the nature and type of problem the step could help prevent from occurring or getting worse;
 - resources allocated to ensure preventative benefits will be delivered; and
 - monitoring and review of how effectively the step is preventing problems from occurring or getting worse.
- 18 Our examination was also informed by the positive indicators for 'prevention' that we have identified and used as part of this examination.³

What we found

- 19 We identified the following strengths:
- the Council has committed resources to the achievement of more sustainable forms of transport in and around the City to prevent deaths from poor air quality and prevent road congestion and the impact on economic development;
 - the Council has a clear understanding of the public health issues and the longer-term impact of climate change on health that could be prevented by a focus on active healthy travel; and
 - targets to address the root causes of poor air quality, arising from congestion, have been established in the Cardiff Wellbeing Plan, which will be monitored on an annual basis.
- 20 We identified the following areas for improvement:
- prioritised phasing of developments, such as cycle routes, bus lanes and sustainable public transport early enough in the construction of new housing developments to prevent reliance on car use from the outset;

³ See Appendix 1

- targeting of prevention activity on the areas of the City where air quality is worst; and
- explore the robustness of the range of measures currently used to monitor the impact of its sustainable travel and clean air quality interventions.

There is clear integration of the sustainable development principle in the Council's policy priorities focussing on critical public health issues and sustainable transport solutions but there is scope to strengthen its approach to integration, for example with neighbouring councils

What we looked for

21 We looked for evidence of consideration of:

- how this step could contribute to the seven national wellbeing goals;
- how delivery of this step will impact on the Council's wellbeing objectives and wider priorities; and
- how delivery of this step will impact on other public bodies' wellbeing objectives.

What we found

22 We identified the following strengths:

- clear integration at policy level between Capital Ambition, the Council's Corporate Plan, National Goals, local Wellbeing Objectives and the Cardiff and Vale Area Plan to achieve a 'Shift to more sustainable forms of transport';
- a Cabinet Clean Air Strategy Group was established to ensure an integrated approach to the issue across Council activities;
- integration of LDP growth agenda into a focus on communities and better infrastructure to enable sustainable travel and achieve modal split; and
- working with schools on an active basis to encourage active travel.

23 We identified the following areas for improvement:

- unclear how Cardiff has integrated its transport plans with neighbouring councils to reduce car travel volumes into the Capital;
- dependence on the Metro brings challenges around aligning and integrating plans in the long term; and
- ensure the integration with other long-term infrastructure plans such as the south east corridor.

24 Our examination was also informed by the positive indicators for 'integration' that we have identified and used as part of this examination.⁴

The Council is collaborating with PSB partners to develop long-term solutions for active travel and public health. The Council would benefit from introducing a similar approach to collaboration with other Capital Region Councils

What we looked for

- 25 We looked for evidence that the Council:
- has considered how it could work with others to deliver the step (to meet its wellbeing objectives, or assist another body to meet its wellbeing objectives);
 - is collaborating effectively to deliver the step; and
 - is monitoring and reviewing whether the collaboration is helping it or its stakeholders meet wellbeing objectives.

What we found

- 26 We identified the following strengths:
- robust and well developed relationships with PSB partners have given rise to progressive and innovative agreements with PSB partners to establish organisational active travel targets;
 - recognition of the wider health implications of poor air quality and mature collaborative working with Public Health Wales to establish the evidence and build interventions in a co-productive approach; and
 - collaboration with Transport for Wales to consider and collaborate on sustainable transport solutions along with the Welsh Government.
- 27 We identified the following areas for improvement:
- the role of Cardiff Capital Region Transport Authority is still developing. The Council needs to build on these emerging regional arrangements as a means to ensuring that collaboration with other Capital City region councils effectively addresses the impact of car congestion;
 - public health input should continue during the development of the White Paper;
 - work with Natural Resources Wales to establish how they can contribute to the Transport and Clean Air Vision; and
 - the role of Cardiff Capital Region Transport Authority is still developing.

⁴ See Appendix 1

28 Our examination was also informed by the positive indicators for 'collaboration' that we have identified and used as part of this examination.⁵

Extensive, independent and well-resourced consultation process undertaken with significant response to the 'Big Ideas'. However, there is scope for clearer involvement of the full diversity of citizens in the design of interventions

What we looked for

- 29 We looked for evidence that the Council has:
- identified who it needs to involve in designing and delivering the step;
 - effectively involved key stakeholders in designing and delivering the step;
 - used the results of involvement to shape the development and delivery of the step; and
 - sought to learn lessons and improve its approach to involvement.

What we found

- 30 We identified the following strengths:
- the Council commissioned Sustainable Development consultants 'Cynnal Cymru' to independently prepare and facilitate engagement;
 - active engagement with schools and education establishments, both in influencing and changing behaviour and in producing active travel plans; and
 - extensive use of social media to highlight congestion, air quality and mitigating effects and distributed electronically to the Cardiff Citizens Panel (approximately 6,000 members).
- 31 We identified the following areas for improvement:
- ensuring that the full diversity of citizens would be involved in the design of the interventions and clean air mitigation factors;
 - opportunities to ensure the full diversity of stakeholders are represented. There is scope to engage with groups such as hearing-impaired loss groups and taxi drivers. and
 - opportunities to involve citizens at a local level in co-production and designing of interventions.

⁵ See Appendix 1

Part Two: Cardiff Council's response

32 Following the conclusion of our fieldwork we presented our findings to the Council at a workshop on 31 May 2019 that was attended by senior officers from the Planning Transport and Environment Directorate, officers with responsibilities for Research Communications and Policy and a representative from public health. At this workshop the Council began to consider its response to our findings and as a result of discussions at the workshop and further reflection on our findings the Council has developed the following actions.

Exhibit 2: Cardiff Council Actions, June 2019

Area of Development	Management Response	Responsible Team/Officer	Agreed Date of Delivery
<p>Long term – The Council has a good understanding of current and future need. However, the potential impact of the Metro and the Council's other priorities should be factored into any long-term interventions.</p>	Benchmarking of transport solutions with national and international cities.	Transport Policy Team	Ongoing
	Fully articulate in the White Paper the interdependencies between the long-term transport plans for the City and the successful implementation of the Metro.	Director of Planning, Transport and Environment	September 2019
	Work with the Welsh Government, Cardiff City Region and partners supported by Cardiff Council match funding to ensure long-term investment in sustainable travel behaviour change activities and initiatives.	Transport Teams	Ongoing

Area of Development	Management Response	Responsible Team/Officer	Agreed Date of Delivery
<p>Integration – There is clear integration of the sustainable development principle in the Council’s policy priorities focussing on critical public health issues and sustainable transport solutions, but there is scope to strengthen its approach to integration, for example with neighbouring councils</p>	<p>Ensure that the White Paper is explicit that in order to reduce car travel into Cardiff the transport plans for Cardiff, City Region and nationally will be interdependent.</p>	<p>Director of Planning, Transport and Environment</p>	<p>September 2019</p>
	<p>Ensure that the White Paper is specific about how the aspirations of the Well-being of Future Generations Act will be supported and the five ways of working applied.</p>	<p>Director of Planning, Transport and Environment</p>	<p>September 2019</p>
	<p>Build upon emerging city-regional governance arrangements, alongside the Welsh Government, Transport for Wales and key stakeholders to agree priorities for transport and land use investment in the Capital Region.</p>	<p>Transport Teams</p>	<p>Ongoing</p>
<p>Involvement – Extensive, independent and well-resourced consultation process undertaken with significant response to the ‘Big Ideas’. However, there is scope for clearer involvement of the full diversity of citizens in the design of interventions.</p>	<p>Create opportunities for the full diversity of stakeholders and under-represented groups to be involved in the design of transport interventions.</p>	<p>Transport Teams</p>	<p>Ongoing</p>
	<p>Establish tailored and iterative design processes for co-production of transport schemes and initiatives that provide opportunities for citizen involvement.</p>	<p>Transport Teams</p>	<p>Ongoing</p>

Area of Development	Management Response	Responsible Team/Officer	Agreed Date of Delivery
<p>Collaboration – The Council is collaborating with PSB partners to develop long-term solutions for active travel and public health. The Council would benefit from introducing a similar approach to collaboration with other Capital Region Councils.</p>	<p>Build upon emerging city-regional governance arrangements, alongside the Welsh Government and Transport for Wales to enable modal shift, capitalising on the Cardiff Metro investments.</p>	<p>Transport Teams</p>	<p>Ongoing</p>
	<p>Explore opportunities to build upon the existing relationships with Natural Resources Wales through the Public Services Board, Air Quality Forum and Schools Monitoring Programme.</p>	<p>Director of Planning, Transport and Environment and Transport Teams</p>	<p>Ongoing</p>
	<p>Continue to work with Public Health Wales during the preparation of the White Paper.</p>	<p>Director of Planning, Transport and Environment</p>	<p>Ongoing</p>
<p>Prevention – Prevention activity is at the centre of the Green Paper with targets established to monitor the impact of preventative interventions and solutions.</p>	<p>Prepare a monitoring strategy that identifies the effectiveness of sustainable travel and air quality interventions and quantifies the variance and accuracy in the measures.</p>	<p>Transport Teams</p>	<p>September 2019</p>
	<p>Continue to plan and monitor the prioritised phasing of sustainable transport interventions for new developments to prevent reliance on car use from the outset.</p>	<p>Transport and Planning Teams</p>	<p>Ongoing</p>
	<p>Continue to target sustainable and active travel interventions where the air quality is worst.</p>	<p>Transport Teams</p>	<p>Ongoing</p>
	<p>Expand messaging on the benefits to health and the environment being key rationales for modal shift.</p>	<p>Communications and Media Team/Transport Teams</p>	<p>Ongoing</p>

- 33 We will continue to monitor the Council's progress in implementing these actions, and the extent to which they address the issues we have identified in our findings.

Appendix 1

Positive Indicators of the Five Ways of Working

The table below sets out 'positive indicators' for each of the five ways of working that we have identified and will use to help inform our assessments of the extent to which bodies may be applying the Sustainable Development Principle (SDP). We do not intend to use the indicators as a 'checklist'. They should be viewed as 'indicators' that will help us to form conclusions, rather than 'determinants' of the extent to which a body is acting in accordance with the SDP in taking steps to meet its wellbeing objectives.

Exhibit 3: Positive Indicators of the Five Ways of Working

What would show a body is fully applying the long-term way of working?

- There is a clear understanding of what 'long term' means in the context of the Act.
- They have designed the step to deliver the wellbeing objective/s and contribute to their long-term vision.
- They have designed the step to deliver short or medium-term benefits, which are balanced with the impact over the long term (within the project context).
- They have designed the step based on a sophisticated understanding of current and future need and pressures, including analysis of future trends.
- Consequently, there is a comprehensive understanding of current and future risks and opportunities.
- Resources have been allocated to ensure long-term as well as short-term benefits are delivered.
- There is a focus on delivering outcomes, with milestones/progression steps identified where outcomes will be delivered over the long term.
- They are open to new ways of doing things which could help deliver benefits over the longer term.
- They value intelligence and pursue evidence-based approaches.

What would show a body is fully applying the preventative way of working?

- The body seeks to understand the root causes of problems so that negative cycles and intergenerational challenges can be tackled.
- The body sees challenges from a system-wide perspective, recognising and valuing the long-term benefits that they can deliver for people and places.
- The body allocates resources to preventative action that is likely to contribute to better outcomes and use of resources over the longer term, even where this may limit the ability to meet some short-term needs.
- There are decision-making and accountability arrangements that recognise the value of preventative action and accept short-term reductions in performance and resources in the pursuit of anticipated improvements in outcomes and use of resources.

What would show a body is taking an 'integrated' approach?

- Individuals at all levels understand their contribution to the delivery of the vision and wellbeing objectives.
- Individuals at all levels understand what different parts of the organisation do and proactively seek opportunities to work across organisational boundaries. This is replicated in their work with other public bodies.
- Individuals at all levels recognise the cross-organisation dependencies of achieving the ambition and objectives.
- There is an open culture where information is shared.
- There is a well-developed understanding of how the wellbeing objectives and steps to meet them impact on other public sector bodies.
- Individuals proactively work across organisational boundaries to maximise their contribution across the wellbeing goals and minimise negative impacts.
- Governance, structures and processes support this, as do behaviours.

What would show a body is collaborating effectively?

- The body is focused on place, community and outcomes rather than organisational boundaries.
- The body has a good understanding of partners' objectives and their responsibilities, which helps to drive collaborative activity.
- The body has positive and mature relationships with stakeholders, where information is shared in an open and transparent way.
- The body recognises and values the contributions that all partners can make.
- The body seeks to establish shared processes and ways of working, where appropriate.

What would show a body is involving people effectively?

- Having an understanding of who needs to be involved and why.
- Reflecting on how well the needs and challenges facing those people are currently understood.
- Working co-productively, working with stakeholders to design and deliver.
- Seeing the views of stakeholders as a vital source of information that will help deliver better outcomes.
- Ensuring that the full diversity of stakeholders is represented and they are able to take part.
- Having mature and trusting relationships with its stakeholders where there is ongoing dialogue and information is shared in an open and transparent way.
- Ensure stakeholders understand the impact of their contribution.
- Seek feedback from key stakeholders which is used to help learn and improve.

Wales Audit Office
24 Cathedral Road
Cardiff CF11 9LJ

Tel: 029 2032 0500

Fax: 029 2032 0600

Textphone: 029 2032 0660

E-mail: info@audit.wales

Website: www.audit.wales

Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru
24 Heol y Gadeirlan
Caerdydd CF11 9LJ

Ffôn: 029 2032 0500

Ffacs: 029 2032 0600

Ffôn testun: 029 2032 0660

E-bost: post@archwilio.cymru

Gwefan: www.archwilio.cymru